

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF ALABAMA
NORTHERN DIVISION

MELVIN LOWE,

Plaintiff/Petitioner,

۷s.

CIVIL ACTION NO. 2:05-CV-0495

MONTGOMERY COUNTY BOARD OF EDUCATION,

Defendant/Respondent.

ΙĴ

DEPOSITION OF QUESHA STARKS, taken

pursuant to stipulation and agreement before

Patricia G. Starkie, Registered Diplomate Reporter,

CRR, and Commissioner for the State of Alabama at

Large, in the Law Offices of Hill, Hill, Carter,

Franco, Cole & Black, 425 South Perry Street,

Montgomery, Alabama, on Tuesday, January 24, 2006,

commencing at approximately 10:15 a.m.

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

	•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
1		last name?
2		THE WITNESS: A-U-D-E.
3	Q:	Have you ever been certified as a reading
4		coach?
5	Α.	No. I'm secondary.
6	Q.	Okay. Have you ever worked in any
7		elementary schools or middle schools?
8	Α.	Well, no, because Bullock County High
9		School, you know not in Montgomery
10		County. That's 7 through 12.
11	Q.	That was 7 through 12?
12	A.	Uh-huh (positive response). Now, junior
13		high school is McKee, you know, as
14		assistant principal, but not as a teacher.
15		That's junior high.
16	Q.	All right. So your current position at BTW
17		is your first term as a first time
18		serving as principal?
19	Α.	Second year oh
20	Q.	But in that position, you've never been a
21		principal anywhere before BTW?
22	Α.	No.
23	Q.	And what process did you go through to
	1	

}		
1		obtain the principal position at BTW?
2	A.	Well, it took a long time because I
3		certified in 1998 as an administrator, and
4		I did not make it as soon as I certified.
5		So I went back into the classroom, and
6		that's when I got the national board
7		certification. So it's taken a while
8		because I certified in 1998, but I didn't
9		get my first job, you know, as a you
10.		know, an administrator or principal until
11		2003-2004.
12	Q.	Okay. But, now, you had an assistant
13		principal position in 2001 at Loveless and
14		Brewbaker Tech at the same time?
15	A.	Okay. And let me retrace this. Let me
16		kind of go back over it because I would
17		have brought my resume.
18		Okay. So for 2003-2004, I was
19		assistant principal at BTW I mean I'm
20	.	sorry. That was
21		MS. CARTER: I think she might be
22		one year off.
23	A.	Yeah, I'm about one year off.

- A. Well, when I was hiring -- when we were trying to find an assistant principal to fill the slot at my school, so --
- Q. How many people were on this committee?
- A. It was basically all of the principals who were looking for an assistant principal, so there had to have been maybe about seven people in that room.
- Q. And what year was this that you were looking for an assistant principal?
 - A. I was looking for an assistant principal 2004-2005, the summer, so that would be 2004. Summer 2004.
- 14 Q. Okay.

2

3

8

11

12

- 15 A. That was the first time I was looking 16 for --
- 17 | Q. So that was --
- 18 | A. Yes.
- Q. And you did an application process the following year, summer of 2005?
- 21 A. I was looking for someone then, too.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. So I sat in on two interviews.

Q. Okay.

1

4

7

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

2 A. And in going back to that, in tracing things, I want to --

Is it okay for me to go back?

- 5 Q. Yes.
 - A. With Dan Aude, he interviewed me for the assistant principalship at BTW.
- 8 Q. Okay.
- 9 A. Okay. Not the principalship. MPS did the principalship.
 - Q. Okay. In your experience as principal, has there ever been a time when you've recommended a candidate for a position and that candidate not be hired?
 - A. Basically -- and it's hard to say that
 because we are asked to submit
 recommendations, our first, second, and our
 third choices. And, you know, all of my
 choices are pretty much, you know, I would
 be okay with either one of them. So I
 can't say that, no, they've been denied.
 It just depends. And then I remember one
 year when I was interviewing, there may

Q.

Α.

22

23

have been some individuals who were 1 currently in the classroom and couldn't be 2 pulled out. That was the 2004-2005 year. 3 So no, not really, because, you know, 4 we're given an opportunity to make 5 recommendations, and I would have been fine 6 with either of the recommendations for 7 2005-2006. 8 Okay. You say either of the 0. 9 recommendations. Did you make two 10 recommendations? 11 I did three. Α. 12 Three? Ο. 13 Uh-huh (positive response). Α. 14 Do you ever indicate to Mr. Barker or Ο. 15 anyone at HR who is your preferred amongst 16 the three? 17 Yes, I can indicate, yes, and that would be Α. 18 in my ranking. But still, going back to 19 what I said, I would be fine with either of 20 the three. 21 Right.

Uh-huh (positive response).

because PEPE is one of our biggest 1 monsters. Teacher evaluations, seeing if 2 individuals are competent to do that. And 3 also interpersonal skills, working with 4 faculty members. That's the largest part. 5 Background experience. I'm on the 6 secondary level, so I'm going to be looking 7 for some individuals who have had some sort 8 of experience on the secondary level, 9 successful experience. 10 Let's talk about the 2005 assistant 0. 11 principal position specifically. 12 Right. Α. 13 Okay. Did Melvin Lowe express an interest 0. 14 in this position? 15 He called me, yes. He called, expressed an Α. 16 interest in it. 17 Did he call you prior to the MPS interview? 0. 18 No. 19 Α. So what was your first interaction with 0. 20 Melvin Lowe? 21 With our telephone call, our conversation. Α. 22 And I'm going back to -- this may have been 23

1		June, July or whatever. Some of the
2		applicants were called. Some of the people
3		who interviewed with MPS followed up with
4		us. My first time really talking to him
5		jobwise was in our interview.
6	Q.	You say our interview?
7	Α.	Yes. My interview with Mr. Lowe.
. 8	Q.	You and Mr. Lowe?
9	A.	Uh-huh (positive response).
10,	. Q.	Did Mr. Lowe participate in the group
11		committee interview?
12	A.	Yes, I remember seeing him.
13	Q.	Okay. Do you remember what your impression
14		was of him based on that group interview?
15	A.	The group interview, you know, we had so
16		many applicants. I'm not saying that he
17		wasn't a good applicant, but, again, I'm
18		looking for three things, you know:
19		Exposure to the magnet performing arts, and
20		then secondly looking at background
21	,	experience, education, what level the
22		person has served on. So I can't say that
23		he was in my top grouping from those

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

18

19

20

21

22

- individuals that I interviewed at MPS. 1
- How many applicants were there at that 0. 2 interview at MPS, do you know? 3
 - I can not give you an estimate. Α.
- I mean, I'm just trying -- was it 5 Q. 10, 50, 100? 6
 - In that single day that I was there, there Α. had to have been over 10, 15 people.
 - Okay. Were there other days where the 0. principals did group interviews?
 - There were other days. I think we had Α. about maybe two sessions, and I know that I wasn't available for one of the sessions.
 - Do you know approximately the size of the 0. applicant pool that you were going to be picking this position from?
- No. Α. 17
 - Okay. Now, you said that Melvin Lowe Q. contacted you after the MPS group interview?
 - And let me put it out here like this Α. because, you know, I said I don't want to give you any information that's incorrect.

- If we go down the listing and we contact a 1 person, you know, they can contact us back. 2
 - Okay. 0.

4

5

6

7

8

9

16

- I do remember him contacting me, but I Α. don't know if it was that he contacted me after, you know, the individuals were called.
- So you don't know if your office initiated 0. the first contact or if he did?
- I can't say that. Α. 10
- Okay. Ο. 11
- You know, I can't say that. Α. 12
- That's fine. Did you and he have a Ο. 13 conversation on the phone when he contacted 14 your office? 15
 - It was just short. Α.
- And Sharon Gjesvold did my scheduled 17 interviews. She was --18
- What was her last name? 0. 19
- Gjesvold. G-J-E-S-V-O-L-D. She's my Α. 20 bookkeeper. She scheduled most of my 21 summer appointments. 22
 - Did Mr. Lowe come in for a face-to-face Q.

interview?

2 A. Yes.

1

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. And what was your impression of that interview?
- Well, I remembered Mr. Lowe. You asked did Α. 5 I have any prior knowledge of him. I 6 remembered him because when we were 7 younger, we had the same piano teacher. So 8 of course, at the beginning of the 9 interview, we had a little small talk. 10 Okay, yeah, I remember you. But he pretty 11 much took charge of the interview. 12 carried it on. I was able to ask a couple 13 of questions, but he pretty much led the 14 interview. 15
- 16 Q. Okay. How long was that interview, do
 17 you --
 - A. That one that day could have been about 30, 35 minutes.
 - Q. And what all did y'all talk about over the course of the interview?
 - A. Well, he talked about his background. He shared background information about

being -- working in productions, serving as a make-up artist, his elementary experience, working in Bullock County also. And basically, I heard a lot about, you know, him.

My questions centered on organizational skills, how do you work well with people, interpersonal skills, but we kind of went off on different tangents about his experience and where he had been and what individuals he had an opportunity to work with and what he had accomplished in his previous jobs. So it really wasn't a structured interview like I initially wanted it to be. It was more conversational as to what I have achieved, this is what I have done, and I have — I will be getting my doctorate from Nova and just a couple of other things.

Q. Based on what you did speak to him about, did you form an opinion based on whether or not he had the qualities that you were looking for, the organizational skills?

- Did he have organizational skills sufficient to fulfill this position?
 - A. Well, I really couldn't, like I say, form an opinion about him at that particular time because the conversation went away from my interview questions to this is who I am. This is what I can do for your program.
- 9 Q. Okay.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

1.4

15

16

17

18

19

20

- 10 A. So until I could look at all of the

 11 applicants grouped together, I can't say,

 12 okay, well, this is the one I'm going to

 13 hire right now.
 - Q. Right. Did you walk away from that interview with any kind of opinion that you can recall?
 - A. Nothing other than, okay, at least he can entertain us with a lot of good conversation. But nothing as to this is going to be the person who I want for the job.
 - 22 | Q. Okay.
 - 23 A. No.

- Q. Now, what kind of certification would be required for this position?
 - A. An administrative certification. And to have that, you have to have completed a course -- your four years and then the master's program, and this is like five classes or more after the master's program. So having an administrative certificate for K through 12, those are the requirements.
 - Q. Are you aware of whether or not Mr. Lowe possesses or possessed at that time an administrative certificate?
 - A. For him to be in the interview with us at central office, I assumed.
- Q. Okay.

- A. But, you know, other than that, I don't know. You don't know.
 - Q. After you had this 30, 35-minute interview with Mr. Lowe, what happened next as far as the hiring process?
 - A. Well, I had to interview -- I interviewed a couple other people. I thought that day

that that was particularly going to be the last of the interviews, but individuals kind of came along. I don't know how many. There was another person that came in following his interview, and then I did a phone interview with his brother because his brother was at a conference.

- Q. The other person came in that same day?
- A. That same day. And it could have been following. And then I had another interview with a teacher who's on my staff, Martin Dukes, and that was he was my last interview, Martin Dukes. He's a social studies teacher at BTW.
- Q. And you stated that Marvin Lowe had a phone interview with you?
- 17 | A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

1.0

11

12

13

14

15

- Q. And that was after you had had the personal, face-to-face interview with Melvin Lowe?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. When was Martin Dukes' interview?
- 23 A. I don't remember the date, but it was

- Q. So he had it prior to you interviewing him?
- 2 A. Uh-huh (positive response).
- Q. Who was actually ultimately hired for that position?
 - A. Ronald Ashley. He was a veteran teacher from Floyd Middle Magnet High School -Junior High School.
 - Q. When was Mr. Ashley interviewed?
- 9 A. He was interviewed -- I believe he was the first one of the day.
- 11 O. Before Melvin Lowe?
- 12 A. Before Melvin.
- 13 Q. Okay.

5

6

7

- 14 A. He could have either been before or after.

 15 I was running a little bit behind time that

 16 day, so I don't know if he was before or

 17 after. I think he was before.
- Q. Okay. So the day that you interviewed

 Melvin Lowe, you interviewed Mr. Ashley --
- 20 | A. Right.
- 21 | Q. -- and Melvin Lowe and another individual?
- 22 A. No, Marvin came the next day on the 23 telephone and then Martin Dukes was the

it as well. And that's about it. I got the number and went on because it's very awkward when you're talking to a brother and then a brother, and they're both candidates for the same position. So it was limited. It wasn't a very long conversation.

- Q. Do you remember when you called Melvin?
 Was it morning, night?
- A. It was evening, like about five, six o'clock.
- Q. So did you call him at his home for Marvin's number?
 - A. Yes, uh-huh (positive response).
- 15 | Q. Did you indicate --
- 16 A. Home or cell.
- O. Did you indicate to Melvin in that phone call that you had already made your decision as to who you were going to recommend for that position?
- 21 A. No.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

14

Q. Did you indicate to Melvin that Marvin had, in fact, applied for that same position?

- Q. Did you recommend Melvin Lowe for -- Let me back up.
 - Did you ever speak with Jimmy Barker about hiring Melvin Lowe for this position?
 - A. I made my recommendations, talked about those recommendations, and that's it.
 - Q. Okay. Who were your recommendations?
 - A. My first recommendation was Ronald Ashley, and I got him. My second one was a Mr. Johnston, who is at Lee High School now. And my third recommendation was his brother, Mr. Lowe's brother.
- Q. Okay. Let's back up. Did you interview Mr. Johnston?
- A. Yes, I did.
- 16 Q. Okay. When did you interview Mr. Johnston?
- A. He had to have been before Mr. Lowe.
- 18 Q. Okay.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

- 19 A. He was one of my first or second interviews.
- 20 O. So was the interview in your office?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. What did you discuss with Mr. Barker with regard to your recommendations?

1.2

A. I talked about Mr. Ashley and just kind of getting some background information; that, you know, he has an excellent reputation. He was very impressive in the interview; I mean, extremely organized, poised. He answered all of the questions and was able to elaborate and provide examples as to where he --

We have an aviation magnet at BTW.

Mr. Ashley has background in the military,
and our aviation teacher was up for PEPE
evaluation this year, so it was just very
impressive to hear about the military
experience and how that could apply to what
we were doing at BTW. So I shared with him
that I was impressed with his organization,
with his presence, and with his
professionalism in the interview.

- Q. Did you discuss Mr. Johnston with Jimmy Barker?
- A. I just discussed that I was impressed with him as well. He had training in logistics, and one of the biggest assignments that an

assistant principal has is to do textbooks, inventory, and he kind of made it clear in his interview that he was well prepared to do that. So I didn't really get into details with that because my focus was Ronald Ashley. I wanted him.

- Q. Did you discuss Marvin Lowe with Mr. Barker?
- A. The brother?
- 10 Q. Yes, Marvin.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

- Yes, I did discuss him, but more so, you Α. 11 know, this is a guidance counselor, he's 12 12 months, and that I was just very 13 impressed with him as well. Because he did 14 come for a follow-up, face-to-face 15 It was a courtesy. After we interview. 16 had our telephone interview, he just 17 stopped by the school one day to meet me 18 face to face and give me some information 19 in my hand. So I discussed that because I 20 had an opportunity to see him face to face 21 beyond the telephone. 22
 - Q. Did you ever discuss Melvin Lowe with Jimmy

Barker?

1

2

4

5

7

14

20

21

22

- No, I didn't, because that was not one of Α. my choices. He was not one of my choices based on the interviews and the HR around the table.
 - And you stated that Ronald Ashley was your 0. first --
- My first choice. Α. 8
- Okay. And he was the one that was hired Q. 9 for the position? 10
- Hired, uh-huh (positive response). Α. 11
- Did Mr. Ashley have any administrative Q. 12 experience prior to BTW? 13
- He was in the classroom for several years. Α. He would be the designee sometimes when his 15 administrator, Johnny Jefferson, who is 16 deceased now, would leave the building, so 17 he had a lot of leadership experience at 18 Floyd Middle and in the community. 19
 - Okay. Did you have any conversations with Q. Melvin Lowe with regard to you recommending him for this position?
 - I didn't say that -- and one reason why I Α.

want to say this clearly is that we cannot tell an applicant that they've been hired. It's just unprofessional. Because what's going to happen if an issue comes up and their qualifications don't match? Because it can happen. Anybody can make mistakes. Human resources, they make the final call. We submit the recommendations, they make the call.

So I have to be very careful, because you can get some people really excited: I know I got the job. But you don't want people leaving upset: Well, I know she's already just excluded me from the interview.

so I didn't leave him with that impression, but I did leave him like I leave all of my applicants: I'm impressed with your resume, what you've done. You know, you will go very far. But not, you're going to get this job. It's just not professional to do that without following protocol.

- Q. Had you ever had a conversation with Melvin where you indicated to him that it would be important to exchange phone numbers because you would be working closely together?
- A. It was important to exchange phone numbers because I have to get all of the contact numbers of the individuals who I've interviewed. You know, you just never know what networking can take place after an interview or when you may have to work with a person in the future. But that's the information I get from everyone. May I have your contact information if I need to contact you in the near future or the future, you know. So...
 - Q. Did you get his contact information at the face-to-face interview, or was this later in a phone call?
 - At the face-to-face interview, he provided all of his documents, all of his information.
- Q. Okay. Other than the conversation that you just spoke of with Jimmy Barker

- Did you do any follow up with the human 0. resources? 2
 - Other than doing the recommendations? Α.
 - Q. Right.

3

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Α. They call us.
- You did the recommendation, and then you Q. 6 You didn't do much follow said you waited. 7 I'm just wondering if you did any 8 follow up with --9
 - I just waited for my phone call. Α.
 - Okay. Did you ever speak to Carolyn Hicks Q. with regard to filling the administrative assistant position in 2005?
 - I'm not sure, because I was talking to her Α. the whole time about filling teaching positions because I had openings in musical You know, it could have been in theater. some conversations with her where I was talking about teachers that something could have come up, but, no, I can't say that I did talk to her. I'm not sure. I could have, but I'm just not sure.
 - Did Mr. Barker ever tell you that you had 0.

to hire a man or a woman to fill any certain position?

- A. No. And I even asked Mr. Barker about this. You know, I need somebody. Does it matter? And he said, no. You need to go with the most qualified candidate, you know. We cannot discriminate based on gender or race. And he shared that with me on my IP, so I remember where I was seated when he said that, you know. He said, no, we cannot discriminate. You choose who you want, and we will, if we can, honor that request. Because there were so many schools that needed assistant principals, and so —
- Q. What was the basis for you even inquiring about that?
- A. There was no basis for me inquiring about it, but there were several applicants, you know, that were interested in positions.

 But he made it very clear. And it could have been just something that was inserted, but he made it very clear that, no, you

- know. Don't look at things like that.
 Because I am...
 - Q. And I guess what I'm asking you is what gave you the impression that that question needed to be asked to clarify that situation?
 - A. Okay. I've been in other situations, not in Montgomery County, where that has been an issue. I have a friend who is an administrator in another county, and, you know, that's an issue. But it wasn't an issue with Montgomery Public Schools.
 - Q. So your basis for inquiring of Mr. Barker whether you needed to take gender or race or anything else into consideration is based solely on --
- 17 A. Other experiences.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

- 18 | Q. -- other experiences with other counties?
- 19 A. Right, with other counties.
- Q. Okay. Do you know if any background or reference check was done with regard to any of the applicants after your interview?
 - A. I'm certain that they went back to just

- Q. Okay. Had you ever worked with him before?
- A. I had not, no.

Q. That's it.

MS. CARTER: I have just a quick clarification.

EXAMINATION

BY MS. CARTER:

Q. You said just for -- because this is our purpose for being here, I just want to clarify this.

You said that when you interviewed

Melvin Lowe in your office that you had

planned for it to be a structured

interview, but it didn't turn out like

that. Explain to us in more detail what

you mean by that.

A. Well, when I said that I planned for it to be a structure interview, there was a set, just like with the human resources interview, of questions that I wanted to ask: Organizational skills, interpersonal skills, experience in the magnet school and in the performing and nonperforming arts.

And I think we got lost right at the beginning of the interview because -- and I asked him -- you know, I told him at the end, because I didn't want to make him feel like he had talked too much in the interview, so I said, you know, thank you.

He said, yes, I've always known that you -- pretty much it's good to take charge of the interview, because people want to hear about everything that you've done. So I heard mostly about Mr. Lowe during the interview, not the questions. My questions weren't being answered.

And then after a certain point, if you're halfway through the interview, then as an administrator who is hiring, you're thinking, okay. If I give you a job assignment, it's going to be about you and not about what the task is about. So it moved more so to this is who I am, this is what I've accomplished. And my questions weren't answered, and I gave up pretty much midway. It moved into just

- conversational, this is what I've done in my lifetime.
- Q. What do you mean, you gave up midway? You gave up trying to ask your questions?
- A. Yes, trying to get through the rest of the questions.
- Q. Was there ever any question or ever a time that Melvin Lowe would have been in your top three picks out of those interviews?
- A. No, because the candidates were so strong.

 And I hate to compare Melvin to Marvin, you know, siblings. My parents did that, you know. But they were -- the candidates that I recommended, they were organized. They knew what they were talking about. When you gave them a question, they responded to it and provided examples as to how they would solve these problems, and they would draw from their previous experience. So that is what guided it because you don't know these individuals.

I knew nothing about Mr. Ashley other than he was coming from Floyd Middle, but

- his responses to the questions, this is what our 500 or so kids need at BTW.
- Q. Did at any time you have a conversation with Jimmy Barker or anybody in central office about Melvin Lowe having a lawsuit or having filed an EEOC charge?
- A. My first time hearing about this was when I got the call to do the deposition. So I'm floored. I'm shocked, you know.
- Q. Okay.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- A. So this is my first time.
- O. Thank you.

13 EXAMINATION

BY MS. DUGAS:

- Q. Have you ever spoken to anyone, any third party, Mr. Barker or anyone from HR -- any third party, for that matter -- about Melvin Lowe?
- A. No. My first time really knowing that he was an administrative applicant was at HR the day he was seated at the table and we were asking -- or the HR officers were
- asking questions. So, no, I haven't talked

about him to anybody, third party.

- Q. Have you talked to anybody subsequent to the interview with him?
- A. No, not to -- no.
- Q. Okay.
- A. No.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

1.0

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

MS. CARTER: One other quick question I forgot.

EXAMINATION

BY MS. CARTER:

- Q. Do you know anything about Melvin Lowe's mother or a lawsuit she might have had against the school at some point?
- A. I have not heard that, anything directly about Melvin's --

Her last name is Lowe, too?

Mrs. Lowe? I haven't --

- O. Yes, it is.
- 19 A. I haven't heard anything about a lawsuit
 20 from her, but I do remember her from
 21 working as an intern. I interned in the
 22 office of student and community support,
 23 but there was no personal --

- Q. Did y'all have any personal issues or personal problems, you and Ms. Lowe?
- A. No. I worked directly under Stan Cox, who is now in Opelika, and she was just one of the individuals in the office.
- Q. Okay. Thank you.

MS. DUGAS: One question.

FXAMINATION

BY MS. DUGAS:

- Q. You said you never heard anything directly. Did you ever hear anything indirectly?
- A. You know what? When you're in -- and just to be honest, when you're in the public school system, things fly around. So I can't say yes or no, because I don't know what I have heard indirectly in the system. You know, part of the human resource function and the human function is to hear gossip and different things floating around, so you never can say when you haven't or have heard things. But, no, I was not aware or knowledgeable of a